Municipal Pensions Oversight Board

City of Williamson
West Virginia
Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund

GASB 68 Actuarial Information for the
Measurement Period Ending
June 30, 2023

Bolton

Submitted by:

James Ritchie, ASA, EA, FCA, MAAA
President of Bolton Retirement
443.573.3924
jritchie@boltonusa.com

Jordan McClane, FSA, EA, FCA, MAAA
Consulting Actuary
667.218.6935
jmcclane@boltonusa.com

Bolton

Employee Benefits, Actuarial & Investment Consulting

December 7, 2023

Ms. Jennifer Lindon
City Clerk
City of Williamson
142 East 4th Avenue
Williamson, WV 25661

Sergeant Grady Dotson
Pension Board Secretary
City of Williamson
Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund

Re: City of Williamson Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund
GASB 68 Actuarial Information for the Measurement Period Ending June 30, 2023

Dear Jennifer,

The following report contains the GASB 67 and GASB 68 actuarial information for the City of Williamson Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund to be included in the City's financial statements for FY 2023. The GASB 67 information has been provided as of June 30, 2023 (the GASB 68 measurement date for FY 2023).

Methodology, Reliance and Certification

This report is prepared for the City. The report contains the actuarial information to be included with the City's financial statements for the year ending June 30, 2023 (the City's fiscal year end date) as required by GASB 68. This information has been prepared for use in the financial statements of the City. This information is not intended for, nor should it be used for, any additional purposes.

The total pension liability is based on the July 1, 2022 actuarial valuation rolled forward to June 30, 2023. The methods, assumptions, and participant data used are detailed in the July 1, 2022 actuarial valuation report with the exception of the actuarial cost method. These calculations are based on the Entry Age Normal cost method as required by GASB 67. The calculation of the Actuarially Determined Contribution for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2023 is contained in the July 1, 2021 actuarial valuation report. The discount rate assumption may have changed if a blended rate was used for GASB purposes.

The included calculations assume that the members and the City will continue to make all required contributions in accordance with the City's funding policy.

The long-term nominal expected rate of return on pension plan investments was determined using a methodology approved by the Municipal Pensions Oversight Board (MPOB) and is based on the funded status (current and projected), equity exposure, and funding policy.

These calculations and comparisons with assets are applicable for the valuation date only. The future is uncertain, and the plan may become better funded or more poorly funded in the future. This valuation does not provide any guarantee that the plan will be able to provide the promised benefits in the future.

Methodology, Reliance and Certification (cont.)

This is a deterministic valuation in that it is based on a single set of assumptions. This set of assumptions is one possible basis for our calculations. Other assumptions may be equally valid. The future is uncertain and the plan's actual experience will differ from the assumptions; the differences may be significant or material because the results are very sensitive to the assumptions made and, in some cases, to the interaction between the assumptions. We may consider that some factors are not material to the valuation of the plan and may not provide a specific assumption for those factors. We may have used other assumptions in the past. We will likely consider changes in assumptions at a future date.

The City is responsible for selecting the plan's funding policy based on five methods allowed for under state law. The actuarial valuation methods are chosen by the actuary in accordance with actuarial standards of practice promulgated by the Actuarial Standards Board of the American Academy of Actuaries and as required by GASB 67 & 68. The MPOB selects the asset valuation methods and assumptions; these selections are reviewed by a qualified actuary no less than every five years. The actuary shall provide a report to the Board with recommendations on any changes to the actuarial process. The policies, methods and assumptions used in this valuation are those that have been so prescribed and are described in this report. The City and MPOB are solely responsible for communicating to Bolton Partners, Inc. any changes required thereto.

The City could reasonably ask how the valuation would change if we used a different assumption set or if plan experience exhibited variations from our assumptions. This report does not contain such an analysis. That type of analysis would be a separate assignment.

The cost of this plan is determined by the benefits promised by the plan, the plan's participant population, the investment experience of the plan and many other factors. An actuarial valuation is a budgeting tool for the City or, in this case, a measure of accounting expense. It does not affect the cost of the plan. As the experience of the plan evolves, it is normal for the level of contributions and expense of the plan to change.

We make every effort to ensure that our calculations are accurately performed. We reserve the right to correct any potential errors by amending the results of this report or by including the corrections in a future valuation report.

Because modeling all aspects of a situation is not possible or practical, we may use summary information, estimates, or simplifications of calculations to facilitate the modeling of future events in an efficient and cost-effective manner. We may also exclude factors or data that are immaterial in our judgment. Use of such simplifying techniques does not, in our judgment, affect the reasonableness of valuation results for the plan.

This report is based on plan provisions, census data, and asset data submitted by the City. We have relied on this information for purposes of preparing this report, but have not performed an audit. The accuracy of the results presented in this report is dependent upon the accuracy and completeness of the underlying information. The plan sponsor is solely responsible for the validity and completeness of this information.

The valuation was completed using both proprietary and third-party models (including software and tools). We have tested these models to ensure they are used for their intended purposes, within their known limitations, and without any known material inconsistencies unless otherwise stated.

Methodology, Reliance and Certification (cont.)

The City is solely responsible for selecting the plan's investment policies, asset allocations and individual investments. Bolton Partners, Inc.'s actuaries have not provided any investment advice to the City.

The information in this report was prepared for the internal use of the City, the plan and their auditors in connection with our actuarial valuations of the pension plan as required by GASB 68. This report may not be used for any other purpose; Bolton Partners, Inc. is not responsible for the consequences of any unauthorized use or the reliance on this information by any other party.

The calculation of actuarial liabilities for valuation purposes is based on a current estimate of future benefit payments. The calculation includes a computation of the "present value" of those estimated future benefit payments using an assumed discount rate; the higher the discount rate assumption, the lower the estimated liability will be. For purposes of estimating the liabilities (future and accrued) in this report, an assumption based on the expected long-term rate of return on plan investments is used. If the plan is expected to become insolvent, the return assumption is blended with a long-term municipal bond rate. Using a lower discount rate assumption, such as a rate solely based on long-term bond yields, could substantially increase the estimated present value of future and accrued liabilities.

This report provides certain financial calculations for use by the auditor. These values have been computed in accordance with our understanding of generally accepted actuarial principles and practices and fairly reflect the actuarial position of the Plan. The various actuarial assumptions and methods which have been used are, in our opinion, appropriate for the purposes of this report.

The report is conditioned on the assumption of an ongoing plan and is not meant to present the actuarial position of the plan in the case of plan termination. Future actuarial measurements may differ significantly from the current measurements presented in this report due to such factors as the following: plan experience differing from that anticipated by the economic or demographic assumptions, changes in economic or demographic assumptions, increases or decreases expected as part of the natural operation of the methodology used for these measurements (such as the end of an amortization period or additional cost or contribution requirements based on the plan's funded status), and changes in plan provisions or applicable law.

The undersigned enrolled actuaries meet the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinion contained herein. The July 1, 2022 actuarial valuation report contains information that is integral to the results contained herein and a copy may be provided upon request.

Sincerely,

James Ritchie, ASA, EA, FCA, MAAA

Jordan McClane, FSA, EA, FCA, MAAA

Net Pension Liability of the Employer

The components of the net pension liability of the Employer at June 30, 2023, were as follows:

Total pension liability	$	2,522,905
Plan fiduciary net position		(1,705,483)
Employer's net pension liability	$	817,422
Plan fiduciary net position as a percentage of the total pension liability		67.60%

Actuarial assumptions. The total pension liability was determined by an actuarial valuation as of July 1, 2022 rolled forward to June 30, 2023 using the following actuarial assumptions, applied to all periods included in the measurement:

Inflation	2.50 percent
Salary increases	Rates vary by years of service
Single discount rate (BOY)	7.00%
Single discount rate (EOY)	7.00%
Investment rate of return (BOY)	7.00%, net of pension plan investment expense, including inflation
Investment rate of return (EOY)	7.00%, net of pension plan investment expense, including inflation
Long-term municpal bond rate (BOY)	3.69%
Long-term municpal bond rate (EOY)	3.86%
Mortality	SOA PubS-2010(B) with generational projection using Scale MP-2019
Year Fund is projected to be fully funded	2039
Year assets are expected to be depleted for a closed plan	N/A

The above is a summary of key actuarial assumptions. Full descriptions of the actuarial assumptions are available in the July 1, 2022 actuarial valuation report.

Sensitivity of the net pension liability to changes in the discount rate

		1% Decrease 6.00%		Current Discount Rate 7.00%		1% Increase 8.00%
Employer's net pension liability	$	1,150,446	$	817,422	$	544,110

Changes in the Net Pension Liability

	Total Pension Liability (a)	Increase (Decrease) Plan Fiduciary Net Position (b)	Net Pension Liability (a) - (b)
Balances at 6/30/22	$ 2,416,598	$ 1,587,214	$ 829,384
Changes for the year:			
Service cost	32,912		32,912
Interest	164,874		164,874
Changes of benefit terms	-		-
Differences between expected and actual experience	31,021		31,021
Changes of assumptions	-		-
Contributions - employer (including Premium Tax Allocation)		116,728	(116,728)
Contributions - member		11,940	(11,940)
Net investment income		112,101	(112,101)
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(122,500)	(122,500)	-
Administrative expense		-	-
Other		-	-
Net Changes	106,307	118,269	(11,962)
Balances at 6/30/23	$ 2,522,905	$ 1,705,483	$ 817,422
Return on Investments		7.0%	

Components of Employer's Pension Expense for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2023

Note	Description	Amount
A	Service cost	$ 32,912
B	Interest on the total pension liability	164,874
A	Changes of benefit terms	-
C	Differences between expected and actual experience	25,119
C	Changes of assumptions	-
A	Employee contributions	(11,940)
D	Projected earnings on pension plan investments	(111,320)
C	Differences between expected and actual earnings on plan investments	(13,488)
A	Pension plan administrative expense	-
A	Other changes in fiduciary net position	-
	Total Pension Expense	**$ 86,157**

Notes:

A Provided in the Changes in Net Pension Liability exhibit.

B Based on the following calculation:

	Amount for Period (a)	Portion of Period (b)	Interest Rate (c)	Projected Earnings (a) x (b) x (c)
Beginning total pension liability	$ 2,416,598	100%	7.00%	$ 169,162
Service cost (End of Year)	32,912	0%	7.00%	-
Benefit payments, including refunds of employee contributions	(122,500)	50%	7.00%	(4,288)
Total interest on the total pension liability				**$ 164,874**

C Provided in the Schedules of Deferrals.

D Based on the following calculation:

	Amount for Period (a)	Portion of Period (b)	Projected Rate of Return (c)	Projected Earnings (a) x (b) x (c)
Beginning plan fiduciary net position	$ 1,587,214	100%	7.00%	$ 111,105
Employer contributions	116,728	50%	7.00%	4,085
Employee contributions	11,940	50%	7.00%	418
Benefit payments, including refunds of employee contributions	(122,500)	50%	7.00%	(4,288)
Administrative expense and other	-	50%	7.00%	-
Total Projected Earnings				**$ 111,320**

Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Related to Pensions

At June 30, 2023, the Employer reported deferred outflows of resources and deferred inflows of resources related to pensions from the following sources:

	Deferred Outflows of Resources	Deferred Inflows of Resources
Differences between expected and actual experience	$ 15,510	$ -
Changes of assumptions	-	-
Net difference between projected and actual earnings on pension plan investments	6,228	-
Total	**$ 21,738**	**$ -**

Amounts reported as deferred outflows of resources and deferred inflows of resources related to pensions will be recognized in pension expense as follows:

Year ended June 30:	
2024	$ 1,336
2025	(18,028)
2026	38,587
2027	(157)
2028	-
Thereafter	-

City of Williamson, West Virginia Policemen’s Pension and Relief Fund
Actuarial Information to Include in the Financial Statements
for the June 30, 2023 Measurement Date

Changes in the Employer's Net Pension Liability and Related Ratios
Last 10 Fiscal Years

Total pension liability	2023	2022	2021	2020	2019	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014
Service cost	$ 32,912	$ 32,575	$ 36,133	$ 56,476	$ 47,729	$ 56,199	$ 81,668	$ 56,578	$ 58,660	$ 74,832
Interest	164,874	158,758	167,815	146,957	136,791	151,424	147,596	140,673	139,886	134,217
Changes of benefit terms	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Differences between expected and actual experience	31,021	19,216	(33,006)	166,768	148,880	(377,897)	(25,921)	(60,412)	58,023	-
Changes of assumptions	-	-	(175,504)	(783,372)	-	-	-	326,409	-	-
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(122,500)	(123,857)	(125,757)	(131,456)	(128,732)	(116,063)	(107,647)	(124,468)	(121,121)	(115,867)
Net change in total pension liability	106,307	86,692	(130,319)	(544,627)	204,668	(286,337)	95,696	338,780	135,448	93,182
Total pension liability - beginning	2,416,598	2,329,906	2,460,225	3,004,852	2,800,184	3,086,521	2,990,825	2,652,045	2,516,597	2,423,415
Total pension liability - ending (a)	**$ 2,522,905**	**$ 2,416,598**	**$ 2,329,906**	**$ 2,460,225**	**$ 3,004,852**	**$ 2,800,184**	**$ 3,086,521**	**$ 2,990,825**	**$ 2,652,045**	**$ 2,516,597**

Plan fiduciary net position	2023	2022	2021	2020	2019	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014
Contributions - employer (including Premium Tax Allocation)	$ 116,728	$ 147,311	$ 107,110	$ 164,770	$ 32,000	$ 190,426	$ 175,973	$ 177,454	$ 159,808	$ 166,409
Contributions - member	11,940	9,725	9,307	9,663	9,284	9,607	12,700	13,142	14,090	10,825
Net investment income	112,101	(78,284)	371,633	41,112	55,296	(155,698)	1,667	1,669	3,603	2,734
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(122,500)	(123,857)	(125,757)	(131,456)	(128,732)	(116,063)	(107,647)	(124,468)	(121,121)	(115,867)
Administrative expense	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	(964)	(58)	(900)
Other	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Net change in plan fiduciary net position	$ 118,269	$ (45,105)	$ 362,293	$ 84,089	$ (32,152)	$ (71,728)	$ 82,693	$ 66,833	$ 59,322	$ 63,201
Plan fiduciary net position - beginning	1,587,214	1,632,319	1,270,026	1,185,937	1,218,089	1,289,817	1,207,124	1,140,291	1,083,969	1,020,768
Plan fiduciary net position - ending (b)	**$ 1,705,483**	**$ 1,587,214**	**$ 1,632,319**	**$ 1,270,026**	**$ 1,185,937**	**$ 1,218,089**	**$ 1,289,817**	**$ 1,207,124**	**$ 1,140,291**	**$ 1,083,969**
Employer's net pension liability - ending (a)-(b)	$ 817,422	$ 829,384	$ 697,587	$ 1,190,199	$ 1,818,915	$ 1,582,095	$ 1,796,704	$ 1,783,701	$ 1,511,754	$ 1,432,628
Plan fiduciary net position as a percentage of the total pension liability	67.60%	65.68%	70.06%	51.62%	39.47%	43.50%	41.79%	40.36%	43.00%	43.07%
Covered payroll	$ 131,106	$ 130,908	$ 125,693	$ 122,628	$ 98,680	$ 112,483	$ 177,175	$ 156,151	$ 165,404	$ 194,249
Employer's net pension liability as a percentage of covered payroll	623.48%	633.56%	554.99%	970.58%	1843.25%	1406.52%	1014.08%	1142.29%	913.98%	737.52%
Expected average remaining service years of all participants	2.00	2.00	2.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	4.71	4.33	4.35	N/A

Notes to Schedule:

Benefit changes: There were no changes for FY2023.

Changes of assumptions: There were no changes for FY2023.

City of Williamson, West Virginia Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund
Actuarial Information to Include in the Financial Statements
for the June 30, 2023 Measurement Date

Schedule of Employer Contributions
Last 10 Fiscal Years

	2023	2022	2021	2020	2019	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014
Actuarially determined contribution	$ 85,456	$ 86,626	$ 117,952	$ 121,150	$ 134,986	$ 117,862	$ 152,056	$ 143,471	$ 117,129	$ 126,116
Contributions in relation to the actuarially determined contribution										
Employer provided	52,078	15,000	43,481	106,749	32,000	127,500	113,047	103,331	118,895	121,219
State provided	64,650	132,311	63,629	58,021	-	62,926	62,926	74,123	40,913	45,190
Contribution deficiency (excess)	$ (31,272)	$ (60,685)	$ 10,842	$ (43,620)	$ 102,986	$ (72,564)	$ (23,917)	$ (33,983)	$ (42,679)	$ (40,293)
Covered payroll	$ 131,106	$ 130,908	$ 125,693	$ 122,628	$ 98,680	$ 112,483	$ 177,175	$ 154,151	$ 165,404	$ 194,249
Contributions as a percentage of covered employee payroll	89.03%	112.53%	85.22%	134.37%	32.43%	169.29%	99.32%	115.12%	96.62%	85.67%

Notes to Schedule

Valuation date:
Actuarially determined contribution amounts are calculated as of the beginning of the fiscal year (July 1) for the year immediately following the fiscal year. The assumption shown below are those used in the 7/1/2021 actuarial valuation to calculate the FY2023 ADC. Assumptions used to determine all contributions in the past would not have been the same.

Methods and assumptions used to determine contribution rates:

Actuarial cost method	Entry Age Normal
Amortization method	Level Dollar
Remaining amortization period	15 to 27.5 years
Asset valuation method	4-year smoothed market
Inflation	2.50 percent
Salary increases	Rates vary by years of service
Investment rate of return	7.00%, net of pension plan investment expense, including inflation
Retirement age	Rates vary by age
Mortality	SOA PubS-2010(B) with generational projection using Scale MP-2019

Schedule of Differences between Projected and Actual Earnings on Pension Plan Investments

In conformity with paragraph 33b of Statement 68, the effects of differences between projected and actual earnings on pension plan investments are recognized in pension expense using a systematic and rational method over a closed five-year period, beginning in the current reporting period. The following table illustrates the application of this requirement.

			Increase (Decrease) in Pension Expense Arising from the Recognition of Differences between Projected and Actual Earnings on Plan Investments								
Year	Differences between Projected and Actual Earnings on Pension Plan Investments	Recognition Period (Years)	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026	2027
2019	$ 3,422	5	$ 684	684	684	684	686				
2020	19,260	5		$ 3,852	3,852	3,852	3,852	3,852			
2021	(283,057)	5			$ (56,611)	(56,611)	(56,611)	(56,611)	(56,613)		
2022	193,707	5				$ 38,741	38,741	38,741	38,741	38,743	
2023	(781)	5					$ (156)	(156)	(156)	(156)	(157)
Net increase (decrease) in pension expense							$ (13,488)	$ (14,174)	$ (18,028)	$ 38,587	$ (157)

Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Arising from Differences between Projected and Actual Earnings on Pension Plan Investments

				Balances at June 30, 2023	
Year	Investment Earnings Less than Projected (a)	Investment Earnings Greater Than Projected (b)	Amounts Recognized in Pension Expense Through June 30, 2023 (c)	Deferred Outflows of Resources (a) - (c)	Deferred Inflows of Resources (b) - (c)
2019	$ 3,422	$ -	$ 3,422	$ -	$ -
2020	19,260	-	15,408	3,852	-
2021	-	283,057	169,833	-	113,224
2022	193,707	-	77,482	116,225	-
2023	-	781	156	-	625
				$ 120,077	**$ 113,849**

City of Williamson, West Virginia Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund
Actuarial Information to Include in the Financial Statements
for the June 30, 2023 Measurement Date

Schedule of Differences between Expected and Actual Experience

In conformity with paragraph 33a of Statement 68, the effects of differences between expected and actual experience are recognized in pension expense, beginning in the current reporting period, using a systematic and rational method over a closed period equal to the average of the remaining service lives of all employees that are provided with pensions through the pension plan (active and inactive employees), determined as of the beginning of the measurement period. The following table illustrates the application of this requirement.

			Increase (Decrease) in Pension Expense Arising from the Recognition of Differences between Expected and Actual Experience																
Year	Differences between Expected and Actual Experience	Recognition Period (Years)	Prior	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026	2027	2028	Thereafter
Prior	-	-																	-
2014	-	-																	
2015	58,023	4.354250			$ 13,326	13,326	13,326	13,326	4,719										
2016	(60,412)	4.331357				$ (13,948)	(13,948)	(13,948)	(13,948)	(4,620)									
2017	(25,921)	4.714136					$ (5,499)	(5,499)	(5,499)	(5,499)	(3,925)								
2018	(377,897)	3.000000						$ (125,966)	(125,966)	(125,965)									
2019	148,880	3.000000							$ 49,627	49,627	49,626								
2020	166,768	3.000000								$ 55,589	55,589	55,590							
2021	(33,006)	2.000000									$ (16,503)	(16,503)							
2022	19,216	2.000000										$ 9,608	9,608						
2023	31,021	2.000000											$ 15,511	15,510					
Net increase (decrease) in pension expense													$ 25,119	$ 15,510	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -

Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Arising from Differences between Expected and Actual Experience

				Balances at June 30, 2023	
Year	Experience Losses (a)	Experience Gains (b)	Amounts Recognized in Pension Expense Through June 30, 2023 (c)	Deferred Outflows of Resources (a) - (c)	Deferred Inflows of Resources (b) - (c)
Prior	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
2014	-	-	-	-	-
2015	58,023	-	58,023	-	-
2016	-	60,412	60,412	-	-
2017	-	25,921	25,921	-	-
2018	-	377,897	377,897	-	-
2019	148,880	-	148,880	-	-
2020	166,768	-	166,768	-	-
2021	-	33,006	33,006	-	-
2022	19,216	-	19,216	-	-
2023	31,021	-	15,511	15,510	-
				$ 15,510	**$ -**

Schedule of Changes of Assumptions

In conformity with paragraph 33a of Statement 68, the effects of changes of assumptions should be recognized in pension expense, beginning in the current reporting period, using a systematic and rational method over a closed period equal to the average of the remaining service lives of all employees that are provided with pensions through the pension plan (active and inactive employees), determined as of the beginning of the measurement period. The following table illustrates the application of this requirement.

			Increase (Decrease) in Pension Expense Arising from the Effects of Changes of Assumptions																	
Year	Changes of Assumptions	Recognition Period (Years)	Prior	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026	2027	2028	Thereafter
Prior	$ -	-																	-
2014	-	-																	
2015	-	4.354250																	
2016	326,409	4.331357				$ 75,360	75,360	75,360	75,360	24,969									
2017	-	4.714136																	
2018	-	3.000000																	
2019	-	3.000000																	
2020	(783,372)	3.000000								$ (261,124)	(261,124)	(261,124)							
2021	(175,504)	2.000000									$ (87,752)	(87,752)							
2022	-	2.000000																	
2023	-	2.000000																	
Net increase (decrease) in pension expense													$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -

Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Arising from Changes of Assumptions

				Balances at June 30, 2023	
Year	Increases in the Total Pension Liability (a)	Decreases in the Total Pension Liability (b)	Amounts Recognized in Pension Expense Through June 30, 2023 (c)	Deferred Outflows of Resources (a) - (c)	Deferred Inflows of Resources (b) - (c)
Prior	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
2014	-	-	-	-	-
2015	-	-	-	-	-
2016	326,409	-	326,409	-	-
2017	-	-	-	-	-
2018	-	-	-	-	-
2019	-	-	-	-	-
2020	-	783,372	783,372	-	-
2021	-	175,504	175,504	-	-
2022	-	-	-	-	-
2023	-	-	-	-	-
				$ -	**$ -**